SUNSHINE LAW MEETING



HAWAI'I STATE ETHICS COMMISSION

State of Hawai'i · Bishop Square, 1001 Bishop Street, ASB Tower 970 · Honolulu, Hawai'i 96813

NOTICE OF MEETING OF THE HAWAI'I STATE ETHICS COMMISSION

Commissioners:

Wesley Fong, Chair

Beverley Tobias, Vice-Chair • Robert Hong • Cynthia Thielen

Date: April 17, 2024

<u>Time</u>: 9:00 a.m.

Location: Zoom Videoconference or Phone:

Videoconference: Join Zoom Meeting

https://us06web.zoom.us/j/81128425968?pwd=U8psA

cMyRBRqEOzr0qlu3cvRXld0B5.1

Phone: +1 (669) 900-6833 or +1 (719) 359-4580

Phone passcode: 776313

Meeting ID: 811 2842 5968

Passcode: zukpJ7

Public Meeting Location:

Hawai'i State Ethics Commission Conference Room 1001 Bishop Street American Savings Bank Tower, Suite 970 Honolulu, Hawai'i 96813

Pursuant to Hawai'i Revised Statutes section 92-3.7, the State Ethics Commission will meet remotely using interactive conference technology. The public may either attend the meeting in person, at the public meeting location above, or participate remotely by using the above Zoom meeting information. If participating remotely, please mute your phone/device except while testifying. If the Commission's videoconference connection is lost during the meeting, please go to the Commission's website (www.ethics.hawaii.gov) for more information, including reconnection information.

Public meeting materials for this meeting are available on the Commission's website at: www.ethics.hawaii.gov.

Telephone: (808) 587-0460 Email: ethics@hawaii.gov Website: http://ethics.hawaii.gov/

<u>A G E N D A</u>

CALL TO ORDER

I. Consideration and Approval of the Minutes of the March 20, 2024 Meeting

Attachment 1: Sunshine Law Meeting Minutes of the March 20, 2024 Hawai'i State Ethics Commission Meeting

II. <u>Directors' Report</u>

1. Education / Training Report

Attachment 1: 2024 Training Schedule

Attachment 2: Online Training Completions by Department and Board

2. Guidance and Assignment Statistics - March 2024

Attachment 3: 2024 Guidance and Assignment Statistics / Website Traffic

3. Miscellaneous Office Projects / Updates

Attachment 4: Q3 Financial Report

III. <u>Discussion of Media Reports Concerning Ethics or the Ethics Commission</u>
<u>Since the Last Meeting</u>

IV. 2024 Legislative Matters

New bills of interest, introduced in 2024, are described briefly below. The blue house or senate bill number is a clickable hyperlink that goes directly to the bill language online. If the hyperlink does not work, bills can be looked up at "capitol.hawaii.gov" and the bill number can be looked up in a box in the upper right-hand corner.

Bills that have not yet "crossed over" are generally considered dead for this legislative session.

Budget

HB 2520 (Ethics Commission budget). Act 002 (3/14/2024).

Commission Procedures

- HB 1881 (Maximum administrative fine). Transmitted to House (4/9/2024).
- SB 2216 SD1 (Advice & investigation procedures). Received notice of disagreement (4/5/2024).

Disclosure Reporting

- SB 2217 (Fiscal reporting periods). Received notice of disagreement (4/5/2024).
- HB 1884 (Legislator disclosures). House disagrees with Senate amendments (4/9/2024).

Campaign Finance

 HB 2184 (Prohibits campaign contributions from persons convicted of campaign finance, lobbying, or ethical offenses). House disagrees with Senate Amendments (4/9/2024).

University of Hawaii Technology Transfer

 SB 3191 (Eliminates sunset provision of the technology transfer exemption). Received notice of disagreement (4/4/2024).

V. <u>Discussion of Ethics Oversight over the Judicial Branch</u>

VI. <u>Akana v. Hawaii State Ethics Commission and Daniel Gluck, Civil No.</u> 18-1-1019-06 (JHA); Akana v. Hawaii State Ethics Commission, Civil No. 19-1-0379-03 (JHA); State of Hawaii, Ethics Commission v. Rowena Akana, Civil No. 20-1-0453 (BIA)

Discussion of case status.

The Hawai'i State Ethics Commission may convene an executive session pursuant to Hawai'i Revised Statutes section 92-5(a)(4) to consult with the Commission's attorneys and/or the Department of the Attorney General on questions and issues pertaining to the Commission's powers, duties, privileges, immunities, and liabilities.

Hawai'i State Ethics Commission Notice of Meeting on April 17, 2024 Page 4

VII. Adjournment

Public Testimony

Anyone wishing to testify may do so during the meeting or may submit written testimony in advance of the meeting by email (info.ethics@hawaii.gov), facsimile (fax) (808-587-0470), or U.S. postal mail (State Ethics Commission, 1001 Bishop Street, American Savngs Bank Tower, Suite 970, Honolulu, Hawai'i 96813). Public testimony must be related to an item that is on the agenda and the testifier must identify the agenda item to be addressed by the testimony. Pursuant to Hawai'i Revised Statutes section 92-3 and Hawai'i Administrative Rules section 21-1-6(c), oral testimony is limited to three minutes per testifier per agenda item, subject to the reasonable discretion of the Chair.

Auxiliary Aid or Accommodation Due to a Disability

If you require an auxiliary aid or accommodation due to a disability, please contact the State Ethics Commission at (808) 587-0460 or email the Commission at info.ethics@hawaii.gov as soon as possible, preferably at least 48 hours prior to the meeting. Last-minute requests will be accepted but may be impossible to fill.

Upon request, this notice is available in alternate/accessible formats.

SUNSHINE LAW MEETING AGENDA ITEM I

CONSIDERATION AND APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE MARCH 20, 2024 MEETING

Sunshine Law Meeting Minutes of the March 20, 2024 Hawai'i State Ethics Commission Meeting Attachment 1:

1 2 3		SUNSHINE LAW MEETING MINUTES OF THE HAWAI'I STATE ETHICS COMMISSION
4 5		STATE OF HAWAI'I
6 7 8	Date:	March 20, 2024
9	Time:	9:00 a.m.
10 11 12	Location:	Held via Zoom video and audio conference
13 14 15	Link:	Recorded video available at https://ethics.hawaii.gov/category/commissionmeetings/comm_videos/
16 17		Public Meeting Location
18 19 20 21		Hawaiʻi State Ethics Commission Conference Room 1001 Bishop Street American Savings Bank Tower, Suite 970 Honolulu, Hawaiʻi 96813
22 23 24	Present:	State Ethics Commission Members
25 26 27 28		Wesley F. Fong, Chair (present in conference room) Beverley Tobias, Vice Chair (via video conference) Robert Hong, Commissioner (present in conference room) Cynthia Thielen, Commissioner (via video conference)
29 30		State Ethics Commission Staff
31 32 33 34 35 36 37 38 39 40 41 42 43		Robert D. Harris, Executive Director (present in conference room) Kee M. Campbell, Enforcement Director (via video conference) Bonita Y.M. Chang, Compliance Director (via video conference) Nancy C. Neuffer, Staff Attorney (via video conference) Jennifer M. Yamanuha, Staff Attorney (via video conference) Jodi L. K. Yi, Staff Attorney (via video conference) Patrick W.C. Lui, Computer Specialist (via video conference) Jared Elster, Investigator (via video conference) Barbara Gash, Investigatory Analyst (present in conference room) Myles A. Yamamoto, Administrative Assistant (present in conference room)
44 45		Members of the Public
46 47		Chad Candice Park, Deputy Attorney General, Office of the Attorney General

CALL TO ORDER (0:00)

Chair Fong called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m. Chair Fong, Vice Chair Tobias, Commissioner Thielen, Commissioner Hong, and Commission staff were present. All commissioners and staff participating via video or audio conference confirmed no one was in the room with them at their respective remote locations.

Agenda Item No. I: Consideration and Approval of the Minutes of the January 17, 2024 Meeting (2:30)

Commissioner Hong made, and Vice Chair Tobias seconded, a motion to approve the minutes of the January 17, 2024 meeting. The motion carried (Fong, Tobias, and Hong, voting in the affirmative with Thielen excused).

Agenda Item No. II: Consideration and Approval of the Minutes of the February 21, 2024 Meeting (3:24)

Commissioner Thielen made, and Vice Chair Tobias seconded, a motion to approve the minutes of the February 21, 2024 meeting. The motion carried (Fong, Tobias, and Thielen voting in the affirmative with Hong excused).

Agenda Item No. III: Directors' Report (4:19)

Compliance Director Bonita Chang reported that staff are in the midst of the annual financial disclosure filing period for current employee and board filers. Requests for updated lists of employee filers have been sent to each state agency. In addition to providing updates on new employees and changes to existing employees, agencies were asked to provide information regarding total employee headcount and approximate training completion percentage.

Director Chang also reported that the Department of Education is in the process of implementing a new Learning Management System. Staff is working with the DOE to integrate the ethics training modules into this system. She noted that DOE is the largest state agency with over 25,000 employees. Director Chang reported that staff will be participating in a training session for state public charter schools in April.

Executive Director Robert Harris noted that the training percentages shown in the meeting materials are based on the number of certificates of completions that are reported for an agency. The data is based on past completions and may not reflect information maintained by the specific agency or board. He also noted that the information for the boards and commissions is more accurate as staff can comb through the numbers better to determine actual completion rates.

6 7

8

14 15 16

17

18

19 20 21

22

23 24 25

26 27

28 29 30

31 32 33

34

35 36 37

39 40

38

46

47

Chair Fong inquired why some agencies have a completion rate over 100%. Director Harris replied that this is due to the inability of the system to screen out duplicate completions thus, if employees took the training multiple times, it would add to the completion percentages. He further noted that the numbers may also reflect both new and outgoing members who have completed training.

Chair Fong asked about progress towards the 85% training compliance goal. Director Chang replied that progress is being made toward that goal. She noted that staff estimates a 75% completion percentage. Director Chang stated that 85% completion is a realistic goal. Reaching out to large agencies like the Department of Education and the University of Hawai'i will help to maximize staff resources to achieve this goal.

Enforcement Director Kee Campbell reported that staff continue to close matters at the same rate that new matters are opened.

Executive Director Robert Harris introduced new Investigatory Analyst Barbara Gash. Analyst Gash previously worked at the Department of Commerce and Consumer Affairs. Analyst Gash then spoke a little about her background. She noted that she has a background in law and financial fraud issues.

Chair Fong welcomed Analyst Gash and asked what additional experience she has in addition to her work with DCCA. Analyst Gash replied that she worked in the Division of Financial Institutions and at the federal level. Additionally, she worked for the Office of Disciplinary Counsel and practiced law.

Vice Chair Tobias and Commissioner Thielen also welcomed Analyst Gash.

Agenda Item No. IV: Discussion of Media Reports Concerning Ethics or the Ethics Commission Since the Last Meeting (15:35)

Executive Director Robert Harris reported that there were no items of note related to the Commission.

Agenda Item No. V: 2024 Legislative Matters (16:15)

Executive Director Robert Harris reported that the Commission's budget has been signed by the Governor.

Director Harris highlighted SB 2219. This bill is an attempt to expand the definition of lobbying to include activities related to contracts and procurement. Some members of the House of Representatives expressed concerns. Director Harris noted that some portions of the bill may need to be sacrificed this session to pass something and come back with revisions next session.

 Director Harris highlighted HB 2184. This bill would prohibit those convicted of certain criminal violations or found to violate ethical rules from making a political campaign contribution. Director Harris explained that he had constitutional concerns with the proposed broad range of violations that would bar an individual from making a political contribution. Testimony was submitted suggesting that the potential violations at issue be narrowed. In response to Director Harris' concerns, the bill was amended to remove civil violations from the bill. Director Harris noted that this bill is not part of the Commission's package.

Director Harris highlighted SB 3191. This bill would permanently exempt transfers/commercialization of technology at UH from the ethics code. The current exemption is due to sunset. This bill would eliminate the sunset date. The Commission has not taken a position on this bill. Comments were submitted indicating that UH has not consulted with the Commission to date and that the Commission's analysis and role would be unclear given the exceptions.

Chair Fong asked about HB 1881, which would increase the maximum administrative fine the Commission could issue. Director Harris replied that the bill is alive and before the Senate Ways and Means Committee. He expressed hope that the bill would be heard.

Chair Fong asked about SB 3350 which would require justices, judges, and judicial nominees to file financial disclosures with the commission. Director Harris replied that the bill is still technically alive, however, indications are that the House does not intend to move the bill forward. He expects the bill to die this session. Director Harris noted that the Commission did not take a position on the bill but offered comments.

Chair Fong asked about the bill regarding the use by legislators of state equipment. Director Harris replied that this is also not a part of the Commission's package. The bill would allow the use of state equipment for "bonified" community initiatives. Director Harris noted that the bill failed to cross over. He also noted that he did not believe that this legislation was necessary.

Chair Fong asked about the bill to require the Judicial Council to vet appointments to county boards and commissions. Director Harris replied that the bill was never heard in the House and is thus dead for the session.

Agenda Item No. VI: Proposed 2024 Goals (28:35)

Executive Director Harris reported that staff have developed a series of goals to work towards in 2024. He noted that these goals allow staff to focus on specific areas. The goals are as follows:

- 85% state employee training completion rate;
- Public filing and information modernization;
- Enforcement modernization;

- Office modernization; and
- Increased public engagement.

With regards to meeting the 85% training completion goal, Director Harris explained that staff is working to update and upgrade tracking systems. The hope is to provide better data and reporting to help track completions.

With regards to enforcement modernization, Director Harris cited the hiring of Investigative Analyst Barbara Gash as progress toward this goal.

Concerning office modernization, staff are currently focused on migration to new servers and implementing a new data management system.

Director Harris noted that he hopes that the policy of establishing annual goals will become an annual exercise with staff and the Commission.

Chair Fong noted that each goal is very ambitious and asked how staff plans to increase public engagement. Director Harris noted that this goal may become a regular annual goal. He stated that the focus is on engaging strategic partnerships both within government and the public. He stated this includes neighbor island partners as well.

Commissioner Hong asked if the goals are assigned to specific staff to provide for accountability. Director Harris replied that due to the nature of the goals some are assigned to specific staff by default. He noted that the goals may not be 100% met by the end of the year, but that progress will be made on each.

Chair Fong stated that significant accomplishments of the Commission need to made public.

Vice Chair Tobias asked if outreach includes outreach to the other county ethics boards and commissions. Director Harris replied that one of the ideas is to hold quarterly sessions with the various county boards. He noted that these sessions may not necessarily be public facing but more geared toward training opportunities for the commissions.

Chair Fong suggested that the Commission reach out to the counties to offer our support and expertise.

Commissioner Hong recommended that outreach be done in a collaborative fashion rather than a top-down approach. Director Harris agreed with the points brought up by Vice Chair Tobias and Commissioner Hong.

41 42

Agenda Item No. VII: Discussion of Ethics Oversight over the Judicial Branch (41;14)

Executive Director Harris reported that dialogue continues between the Commission and the Judiciary.

Agenda Item No. VIII: Akana v. Hawaii State Ethics Commission and Daniel Gluck, Civil No. 18-1-1019-06 (JHA); Akana v. Hawaii State Ethics Commission, Civil No. 19-1-0379-03 (JHA); State of Hawaii, Ethics Commission v. Rowena Akana, Civil No. 20-1-0453 (BIA) (41:40)

Executive Director Harris reported that Ms. Akana had requested and was granted an extension to file an appeal to the supreme court. He believes that the extended deadline has passed. He was unsure if an appeal was filed.

Agenda Item No. IX: Evaluation of Executive Director Robert Harris (43:53)

Chair Fong noted that at the request of Executive Director Harris and in the spirit of openness and transparency, the evaluation of Executive Director Robert Harris will be discussed in the open sunshine session of the commission's meeting.

Chair Fong reported that Executive Director Robert Harris was evaluated in nine categories. They are:

Providing Legal Counsel to the Commission

TrainingEnforcement of the Ethics Code & lobbying laws

Education

 Relations with the mediaRelationship building

 Legislation

Budget

 Administration and management

 Director Harris had an average score of 4.74 with a high score of 5.0 and low of 4.5. His top three categories were legislation, relations with the media, and enforcement.

Commissioner Hong expressed his appreciation to staff for providing input throughout the evaluation process.

Director Harris expressed his appreciation to the Commission and staff. He stated that he is honored to be the executive director. He further stated that he felt the

7 8

9

6

Agenda Item No. X: Adjournment of Sunshine Law Meeting (48:42)

At approximately 9:49 a.m., Vice Chair Tobias made, and Commissioner Thielen seconded, a motion to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried (Fong, Tobias, Hong, and Thielen voting in the affirmative).

Minutes approved on

Tobias, Hong, and Thielen voting in the affirmative).

The meeting was adjourned at 9:50 a.m.

comments in the evaluation were important and would take them to heart and continue

to improve. He noted that the high scores are reflective of the great Commission team.

adopt the evaluation of Executive Director Robert Harris. The motion carried (Fong,

Commissioner Hong made, and Commissioner Thielen seconded, a motion to

SUNSHINE MEETING AGENDA ITEM II

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT April 17, 2024

1. Education / Training Report

Attachment 1: 2024 Training Schedule

Attachment 2: Online Training Completions by Department and Board

2. Guidance and Assignment Statistics - March 2024

Attachment 3: 2024 Guidance and Assignment Statistics / Website Traffic

3. Miscellaneous Office Projects / Updates

Attachment 4: Q3 Financial Report

HAWAII STATE ETHICS COMMISSION

2024 EDUCATION PROGRAM

(Ethics Workshops and Presentations)

DATE PRESENTATIONS		IN PERSON PARTICIPANTS	WEBINAR PARTICIPANTS			
1/4/2024	WEBINAR: Lobbyists Law Training	0	50			
1/10/2024	WEBINAR: Lobbyists Law Training	0	48			
1/18/2024	WEBINAR: General Ethics Training 0					
1/19/2024	IN PERSON: Training Refresher, Capitol, House Members	51	0			
2/6/2024	WEBINAR: Training Refresher, DOH, Kauai	0 13				
2/8/2024	4 WEBINAR: Ethics for Board and Commission Members (CANCELLED)					
3/6/2024	WEBINAR: General Ethics Training	0	7			
4/16/2024	WEBINAR: General Ethics Training, Charter Schools					
5/2/2024	WEBINAR: General Ethics Training					
5/16/2024	IN PERSON: Training Refresher, Agribusiness Development Corporation					
6/24/2024	IN PERSON: Ethics for Board and Commission Members, Hawai'i Workforce Development Council					
7/24/2024	WEBINAR: General Ethics Training					
8/8/2024	WEBINAR: Ethics for Board and Commission Members					
9/26/2024	WEBINAR: General Ethics Training					
10/23/2024	WEBINAR: Ethics for Board and Commission Members					
11/7/2024	WEBINAR: General Ethics Training					
TOTAL	16 Presentations	51 participants	126 participants			

State Employees

	# of Current	%	
Department/Agency	Employees*	Completed	
Department of Accounting and General Services (DAGS)	642		
Department of Agriculture (DOA)	249	96%	
Department of Budget and Finance (B&F)	334	86%	
Department of Business, Economic Development and Tourism (DBE	335	90%	
Department of Commerce and Consumer Affairs (DCCA)	541	191%	
Department of Defense (DOD)	404	94%	
Department of Education (DOE)	22,369	60%	
Department of Hawaiian Home Lands (DHHL)	134	95%	
Department of Health (DOH)	2,481	82%	
Department of Human Resources Development (DHRD)	90	91%	
Department of Human Services (DHS)	1,700	87%	
Department of Labor and Industrial Relations (DLIR)	541	59%	
Department of Land and Natural Resources (DLNR)	800	94%	
		2 1/2	
			**Reorg eff. 1/1/24-
			Agency is reconciling
Former Dept: Department of Public Safety (DPS)	3,002	42%	data. Employees
Department of Corrections and Rehabilitation (DCR)	1,882	14%	formerly with DPS have been
Separation of Servestions and Heriasintation (2 Str)		21,70	transferred to DCR
			and DLE.
			and DEE.
Department of Law Enforcement (DLE)	395	25%	
Department of Taxation (TAX)	318	96%	
Department of the Attorney General (ATG)	621	97%	
, , ,			
Department of Transportation (DOT)	2,255		# Based HSEC's data
Hawai'i Health Systems Corporation (HHSC)	3,206	97%	
Hawai'i State Ethics Commission (HSEC)	12	100%	
Have all Chata B. Island B. Contago (USBIG)	420	4.000/	# D d LICECI- d-t-
Hawai'i State Public Library System (HSPLS)	429		# Based HSEC's data
House of Representatives (REP)	166		
Judiciary (JUD)	1,731	96%	
Legislative Reference Bureau (LRB)	33		
Office of Hawaiian Affairs (OHA)	119	87%	
Office of the Auditor (AUD)	25		
Office of the Governor (GOV)	51	100%	
Office of the Lieutenant Governor (LTG)	15		
Office of the Ombudsman (OMB)	10	100%	
			includes indiv.
Public Charter School (SPCSC)	TBD	740/	charter school staff
Research Corporation of the University of Hawai'i (RCUH)	2,742		
Senate (SEN)	104		
University of Hawai'i (aggregate)	12,844		
University of Hawai'i-Community Colleges (UOHC)	2,568		
University of Hawai'i-Hilo (UOHH)	864		
University of Hawai'i-Manoa (UOHM)	8,511		
University of Hawai'i-System (UOH)	502		
University of Hawai'i-West Oahu (UOHW)	399		
Total Employees Training Completed	60,580	Ī	

^{*}Based on annual financial disclosure updates from departments collected in March/April 2023 Percentages based on information reported by agencies in March 2024. Total training completions from January 1, 2020 to March 31, 2024

State Boards and Commissions

	No. of	%
Board/Commission	Members*	Completed
Agribusiness Development Corporation	8	150%
Board of Acupuncture	5	100%
Board of Agriculture	10	100%
Board of Barbering and Cosmetology	7	86%
Board of Certification of Operating Personnel in Wastewater Treatment Plants	9	100%
Board of Chiropractic Examiners	5	80%
Board of Dentistry	12	108%
Board of Education	11	182%
Board of Electricians and Plumbers	7	157%
Board of Land and Natural Resources	7	171%
Board of Massage Therapy	5	120%
Board of Naturopathic Medicine	4	100%
Board of Nursing	9	100%
Board of Pharmacy	7	100%
Board of Physical Therapy	7	100%
Board of Private Detectives and Guards	7	71%
Board of Professional Engineers, etal	13	92%
Board of Psychology	5	100%
Board of Public Accountancy	9	122%
Board of Registration	8	75%
Board of Speech Pathology and Audiology	7	100%
Board on Geographic Names	7	114%
Boxing Commission	3	75%
Campaign Spending Commission	5	100%
Civil Rights Commission	5	100%
Commission on Status of Women	5	180%
Commission on Water Resource Management	7	129%
Contractors License Board	13	92%
Correctional System Oversight Commission	5	100%
Council on Revenues	7	114%
Crime Victim Compensation Commission	3	100%
Defender Council	3	67%
Deferred Compensation Plan Board of Trustees	7	100%
Disability and Communication Access Board	17	112%
Early Learning Board	12	67%
Elections Commission	9	100%
Elevator Mechanics Licensing Board	7	71%
Employees' Retirement System Board of Trustees	8	175%
Enhanced 911 Board	13	92%
Environmental Advisory Council	15	87%
Festival of the Pacific Arts & Culture	9	78%
Hawai'i Board of Optometry	7	86%
Hawai'i Board of Veterinary Medicine	5	100%
Hawai'i Climate Change Mitigation and Adaptation Commission	20	60%

State Boards and Commissions

	No. of	%
Board/Commission	Members*	Completed
Hawai'i Community Development Authority	13	100%
Hawai'i Employer-Union Health Benefits Trust Fund	10	100%
Hawai'i Green Infrastructure Authority	5	100%
Hawai'i Health Systems Corporation-Corporation	15	73%
Hawai'i Health Systems Corporation-East Hawai'i	11	100%
Hawai'i Health Systems Corporation-Kauai	8	63%
Hawai'i Health Systems Corporation-Maui	2	50%
Hawai'i Health Systems Corporation-Oahu	8	125%
Hawai'i Health Systems Corporation-West Hawai'i	9	56%
Hawai'i Historic Places Review Board	5	100%
Hawai'i Housing Finance and Development Corporation	9	78%
Hawai'i Law Enforcement Standards Board	14	64%
Hawai'i Medical Board	11	182%
Hawai'i Paroling Authority	5	100%
Hawai'i Public Housing Authority	10	180%
Hawai'i Retirement Savings Board	8	100%
Hawai'i State Emergency Response Commission	9	82%
Hawai'i State Ethics Commission	5	120%
Hawai'i State Fire Council	4	150%
Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board	17	88%
Hawai'i Technology Development Corporation	8	100%
Hawai'i Tourism Authority	11	92%
Hawaiian Homes Commission	9	122%
Hoisting Machine Operators Advisory Board	4	80%
Island Burial Council - Hawai'i	5	60%
Island Burial Council - Kauai/Niihau	6	50%
Island Burial Council - Maui/Lanai	6	33%
Island Burial Council - Molokai	1	100%
Island Burial Council - Oahu	8	63%
Kahoʻolawe Island Reserve Commission	4	100%
King Kamehameha Celebration Commission	15	100%
Land Use Commission	9	178%
Legacy Land Conservation Commission	8	100%
Mauna Kea Stewardship & Oversight Authority	10	83%
Medical Education Council	12	92%
Merit Appeals Board	3	100%
Motor Vehicle Industry Licensing Board	7	100%
Motor Vehicle Repair Industry Board	2	50%
National and Community Service, Hawai'i Commission for	15	73%
Natural Area Reserves System Commission	9	100%
Natural Energy Laboratory of Hawaiʻi	11	100%
Oahu Metropolitan Planning Organization	14	64%
Other Board/Commission		0%
Pacific International Space Center for Exploration Systems	4	100%

State Boards and Commissions

	No. of	%
Board/Commission	Members*	Completed
Pest Control Board	9	78%
Public Water System Operators, Board of Certification of	3	100%
Radiologic Technology Board	5	60%
RCUH-Board of Directors	6	100%
Real Estate Commission	9	144%
School Facilities Authority Board	3	100%
Soil and Water Conservation District Boards	84	81%
Stadium Authority Commission	8	138%
State Council on Developmental Disabilities	28	71%
State Foundation on Culture and the Arts	7	186%
State Public Charter School Commission	9	167%
Statewide Health Coordinating Council	9	122%
University of Hawai'i Board of Regents	11	200%
Total Board/Commission Members Training Completed	904	

^{*}Membership number is based on full membership and may include vacant positions Total training completions from January 1, 2020 to March 31, 2024

Training statistics # of In-Person Trainings	1 51 2,152 267 5 126 301
# of People Trained In Person # of On-Line Trainings (Self-Directed) # of Lobbyists Law Trainings # of Training Webinars # of Participants in Training Webinars Attorney of the Day 51 0 0 958 707 487 # 87 # 186 52 29 # 1 1 1 # 1 1 # 1 1 1 # 2 2 3 1 1 # 3 3 1 1 # 3 4 3 5 3 1 # 4 5 5 5 5 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6	2,152 267 5 126 301
# of On-Line Trainings (Self-Directed) # of Lobbyists Law Trainings # of Training Webinars # of Participants in Training Webinars 106 13 7 Attorney of the Day 958 707 487 186 52 29 40 118 89 94	2,152 267 5 126 301
# of Lobbyists Law Trainings 186 52 29 # of Training Webinars 3 1 1 # of Participants in Training Webinars 106 13 7 Attorney of the Day 118 89 94	267 5 126 301 0 131 75
# of Training Webinars 3 1 1 # of Participants in Training Webinars 106 13 7 Attorney of the Day 118 89 94	5 126 301 0 131 75
# of Participants in Training Webinars 106 13 7 Attorney of the Day 118 89 94	126 301 0 131 75
Attorney of the Day 118 89 94	301 0 131 75
	0 131 75
New easimments	131 75
New assignments	131 75
Advisory Opinion 0 0 0	75
Complaint 67 25 39	
Gifts/Invitations/Travel 21 24 30	
Guidance 2 0 2	4
Judicial Selection Comm'n 6 0 5	11
Training Request 0 0 0	0
Record Request 1 1 0	2
Project/Other 6 1 1	8
Total 103 51 77 0 0 0 0	0 0 0 0 0 231
Closed Assignments	
Advisory Opinion 0 0 0	0
Complaint 67 26 26	119
Gifts/Invitations/Travel 21 22 35	78
Guidance 1 3 0	4
Judicial Selection Comm'n 7 0 4	11
Training Request 0 0 0	0
Record Request 1 1 0	2
Project/Other 2 2 2	6
Total 99 54 67 0 0 0	0 0 0 0 0 220
Anti-Fraud 2 5 5	12

Sunshine Law Folder - 4/17/2024 Page 20

HAWAII STATE ETHICS COMMISSION FINANCIAL REPORT FY 2024 (MONTH ENDING: March 31, 2024) Appropriation Symbol: G-24-393-Y6

	Amount Appropriated FY 2023-2024	Expenditures for Qtr. End 9/30/2023	Expenditures for Qtr. End 12/31/2023	Expenditures for Qtr. End 3/31/2024	•	Year-To-Date Expenditures Totals	% of Budget Expended
A. PERSONNEL SERVICES							
Staff Salaries	\$ 1,229,623.00	\$ 282,204.76	\$ 273,415.50	\$ 283,390.50	\$ 0.00	839,010.76	68.2%
Total Personnel Services	\$ 1,229,623.00	\$ 282,204.76	\$ 273,415.50		\$ 0.00	\$ 839,010.76	68.2%
B. OTHER CURRENT EXPENSES							
Office Expenses	16,640.00	6,848.18	7,119.70	4,842.71	0.00	18,810.59	113.0%
Intrastate Transportation and Travel	9,250.00	530.50	0.00	24.75	0.00	555.25	6.0%
Out-of-State Travel	12,660.00	1,448.20	7,482.38	0.00	0.00	8,930.58	70.5%
Equipment Rental and Maintenance	34,100.00	5,107.60	1,429.09	2,146.36	0.00	8,683.05	25.5%
Dues, Subscriptions, Training	20,910.00	2,468.03	3,037.36	4,036.83	0.00	9,542.22	45.6%
Newspaper Advertisements	1,100.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.0%
Comm'n Mtgs, Investigations, Hrgs	12,400.00	3,693.86	938.22	876.95	0.00	5,509.03	44.4%
Consulting Services	42,500.00	0.00	1,147.55	0.00	0.00	1,147.55	2.7%
Office Rent	158,331.00	20,892.12	39,122.82	39,728.42	0.00	99,743.36	63.0%
Total Other Current Expenses	\$ 307,891.00	\$ 40,988.49	\$ 60,277.12	\$ 51,656.02	\$ 0.00	\$ 152,921.63	49.7%
C. CAPITAL OUTLAY							
Office Furniture and Equipment	4,000.00	6,282.72	7,215.00	6,334.18	0.00	19,831.90	495.8%
Total Capital Outlay	\$ 4,000.00	\$ 6,282.72	\$ 7,215.00	\$ 6,334.18	\$0.00	\$ 19,831.90	0.0%
GRAND TOTAL (A+B+C)	\$ 1,541,514.00 ¹	\$ 329,475.97	\$ 340,907.62	\$ 341,380.70	\$ 0.00	\$ 1,011,764.29	65.6%

¹ \$1,541,514 awarded by Act 1, SLH 2023 - Appropriation 393.

HAWAII STATE ETHICS COMMISSION FINANCIAL REPORT FY 2024 (QUARTER ENDING: March 31, 2024)

Appropriation Symbol: G-23-396-Y6

	Amount Appropriated FY 2023-2024	Expenditures for Qtr. End 9/30/2023	Expenditures for Qtr. End 12/31/2023	Expenditures for Qtr. End 3/31/2024	Expenditures for Qtr. End 6/30/2024	Year-To-Date Expenditures Totals	% of Budget Expended
A. ACCRUED VACATION/VACATION TRANS	SFERS						
Vacation Payout	\$ 16,553.00 ¹	\$ 10,011.57	\$ 0.00	\$ 0.00	\$ 0.00	\$ 10,011.57	60.5%
Total Accrued Vacation/Vacation Transfers	\$ 16,553.00	\$ 10,011.57	\$ 0.00	\$ 0.00	\$ 0.00	\$ 10,011.57	60.5%
GRAND TOTAL	\$ 16,553.00	\$ 10,011.57	\$ 0.00	\$ 0.00	\$ 0.00	\$ 10,011.57	60.5%
Appropriation for Accrued Vacation/Vacation Transfer Payments							

¹ Funds for accrued vacation and vacation transfer payments appropriated by Act 3, HB 1514 HD1 SD1, for \$16,553.00.

G:Share/Budget/Reports/2023-24/FY24 Q3

SUNSHINE LAW MEETING AGENDA ITEM III

DISCUSSION OF MEDIA REPORTS CONCERNING ETHICS OR THE ETHICS COMMISSION SINCE THE LAST MEETING

No attachments.

SUNSHINE LAW MEETING AGENDA ITEM IV

LEGISLATIVE MATTERS

No attachments

SUNSHINE LAW MEETING AGENDA ITEM V

DISCUSSION OF ETHICS OVERSIGHT OVER THE JUDICIAL BRANCH

No attachments.

SUNSHINE LAW MEETING AGENDA ITEM VI

AKANA v. HAWAII STATE ETHICS COMMISSION AND DANIEL GLUCK, CIVIL NO. 18-1-1019-06 (JHA); AKANA v. HAWAII STATE ETHICS COMMISSION, CIVIL NO. 19-1-0379-03 (JHA); STATE OF HAWAII, ETHICS COMMISSION v. ROWENA AKANA, CIVIL NO. 20-1-0453 (BIA)

Discussion of case status.

The Hawai'i State Ethics Commission may convene an executive session pursuant to Hawai'i Revised Statutes section 92-5(a)(4) to consult with the Commission's attorneys on questions and issues pertaining to the Commission's powers, duties, privileges, immunities, and liabilities.

No attachments.