# SUNSHINE LAW MEETING



#### HAWAI'I STATE ETHICS COMMISSION

State of Hawai'i · Bishop Square, 1001 Bishop Street, ASB Tower 970 · Honolulu, Hawai'i 96813

#### NOTICE OF MEETING OF THE HAWAI'I STATE ETHICS COMMISSION

Date: April 19, 2023

<u>Time</u>: 9:00 a.m.

Location: Zoom Videoconference or Phone:

Videoconference:	Join Zoom Meeting
	https://us06web.zoom.us/j/86709019878?pwd=dUIJb
	UgyRDNSZ2IDbW5uOTUreTE5dz09
Phone:	+1 (346) 248-7799 or +1 (408) 638-0968
Meeting ID:	867 0901 9878
Passcode:	523432

Public Meeting Location:

Hawai'i State Ethics Commission Conference Room 1001 Bishop Street American Savings Bank Tower, Suite 960 Honolulu, Hawai'i 96813

Pursuant to Hawai'i Revised Statutes section 92-3.7, the State Ethics Commission will meet remotely using interactive conference technology. The public may either attend the meeting in person, at the public meeting location above, or participate remotely by using the above Zoom meeting information. If participating remotely, please mute your phone/device except while testifying. If the Commission's videoconference connection is lost during the meeting, please go to the Commission's website (www.ethics.hawaii.gov) for more information, including reconnection information.

Masks are encouraged for everyone attending the meeting in person.

Public meeting materials for this meeting are available on the Commission's website at: <u>www.ethics.hawaii.gov</u>.

#### <u>A G E N D A</u>

#### CALL TO ORDER

I. Consideration and Approval of the Minutes of the March 15, 2023 Meeting

Attachment 1: Sunshine Law Meeting Minutes of the March 15, 2023 Hawai'i State Ethics Commission Meeting

- II. <u>Executive Director's Report</u>
  - 1. Education / Training Report

Attachment 1: 2023 Training Schedule

Attachment 2: Online Training Completions by Department

2. Guidance and Assignment Statistics – March 2023

Attachment 3: 2023 Guidance and Assignment Statistics / Website Traffic

3. Miscellaneous Office Projects / Updates

Attachment 4: Q3 Financial Report

#### III. 2023 Legislative Session

Bills of interest introduced in 2023 are described briefly below. The blue house or senate bill number is a clickable hyperlink that goes directly to the bill language online. If the hyperlink does not work, bills can be looked up at "capitol.hawaii.gov" by entering the bill number in the search box in the website's upper right corner.

#### i. Budget

 <u>HB 1514</u>. Appropriates funds to provide for the expenses of the Legislature, Auditor, Legislative Reference Bureau, Ombudsman, and Ethics Commission. **Status:** Enrolled into law as Act 003, 3/28/2023.

#### ii. Financial Disclosures

i. <u>SB 182</u> (Ethics Commission package). Amends the fines imposed and the procedures relating to enforcement of a late or missing

Hawai'i State Ethics Commission Notice of Meeting on April 19, 2023 Page 3

financial disclosure statement. **Status:** Headed to conference committee.

- ii. <u>HB 136</u> (Ethics Commission package). Requires each chamber of the Legislature to post on the Legislature's website a report of the legislative allowance expenditures for each member of the respective chamber. **Status:** Likely deferred for 2023, although the Senate posted its <u>legislative allowance expenditures report</u> online and the House has committed to do so.
- iii. <u>HB 141</u> (Ethics Commission package). Requires each state legislator to include within the legislator's disclosures of financial interest the names of lobbyists or lobbying organizations with whom the legislator has a financial relationship. **Status:** Headed to conference committee.

#### iii. Gifts

i. <u>HB 142</u> (Ethics Commission package). Prohibits lobbyists from making gifts that are prohibited under state ethics law. **Status** Signed into law as Act 010, 3/31/23.

#### iv. Lobbyist Law

- i. <u>HB 137</u> (Ethics Commission package). Requires the statement of expenditures filed with the State Ethics Commission to include information on the identity, by bill number, resolution number, budget cost or program identification number, or other identifier, of the legislative or administrative action that was commented on, supported by, or opposed by the person filing the statement during the statement period. **Status:** Signed into law as Act 008, 3/31/23.
- <u>HB 138</u> (Ethics Commission package). Requires the State Ethics Commission to establish and administer a lobbyists training course and make the lobbyist training course mandatory for all lobbyists. Status: Transmitted to the Governor.
- iii. <u>SB 805</u>. Amends the definitions of "administrative action" and "lobbying" in Chapter 97, HRS. **Status:** Deferred.

#### v. Nepotism

i. <u>HB 717</u> (Standards Commission package). Prohibits a legislator or public employee from naming, appointing, or hiring a relative for public employment. Prohibits a legislator or public employee from supervising a relative in public employment. Prohibits a legislator or employee from awarding a contract to a relative. **Status:** Headed to conference committee. Hawai'i State Ethics Commission Notice of Meeting on April 19, 2023 Page 4

#### vi. Post-Employment

i. <u>SB 1187</u>. Increases the post-employment restriction for former legislators from twelve months to twenty-four months. **Status:** Likely deferred.

#### vii. Record Disposition

i. <u>HB 140</u> (Ethics Commission package). Provides the State Ethics Commission with the discretion to maintain or destroy records of financial disclosure statements beyond the current 6-year statutory requirement. Applies retroactively to applicable disclosures that are in the Commission's possession and control. **Status**: Signed into law as Act 009, 3/31/23.

#### IV. Proposed Media Policy:

The Hawai'i State Ethics Commission welcomes transparency, recognizing its responsibility to improve and maintain public confidence in government officials and employees. It shall be the policy of the Commission to issue a media alert with respect to any ethics opinions or decisions, such as an issuance of a settlement agreement or an advisory opinion, with a brief, objective description of the action taken.

V. <u>Proposed Increase to the Commission's Administrative Fine Authority (Haw.</u> <u>Rev. Stat. § 84-39 and Haw. Rev. Stat. § 97-7)</u>

No update on research looking into comparable fine structures in other states.

- VI. <u>Discussion of an Informational Meeting with the State and County Ethics</u> <u>Commissions or Boards.</u>
- VII. <u>Akana v. Hawaii State Ethics Commission and Daniel Gluck, Civil No.</u> <u>18-1-1019-06 (JHA); Akana v. Hawaii State Ethics Commission, Civil No.</u> <u>19-1-0379-03 (JHA); State of Hawaii, Ethics Commission v. Rowena Akana,</u> <u>Civil No. 20-1-0453 (BIA)</u>

Discussion of case status.

The Hawai'i State Ethics Commission may convene an executive session pursuant to Hawai'i Revised Statutes section 92-5(a)(4) to consult with the Commission's attorneys and/or the Department of the Attorney General on questions and issues pertaining to the Commission's powers, duties, privileges, immunities, and liabilities. Hawai'i State Ethics Commission Notice of Meeting on April 19, 2023 Page 5

#### VIII. Evaluation of Executive Director Robert D. Harris

The Hawai'i State Executive Commission may convene an executive session pursuant to Hawai'i Revised Statutes section 92-5(a)(2) to discuss matters relating to the evaluation of an employee, and/or pursuant to section 92-4(a)(4), to consult with the Commission's attorneys on questions and issues pertinaing to the Commission's powers, duties, privileges, immunities, and liabilities.

- IX. Recognition of an Outstanding Commission Employee
- X. <u>Adjournment</u>

#### Public Testimony

Anyone wishing to testify may do so during the meeting or may submit written testimony in advance of the meeting by email (<u>ethics@hawaiiethics.org</u>), facsimile (fax) (808-587-0470), or U.S. postal mail (State Ethics Commission, 1001 Bishop Street, American Savngs Bank Tower, Suite 970, Honolulu, Hawai'i 96813). Public testimony must be related to an item that is on the agenda and the testifier must identify the agenda item to be addressed by the testimony. Pursuant to Hawai'i Revised Statutes section 92-3 and Hawai'i Administrative Rules section 21-1-6(c), oral testimony is limited to three minutes per testifier per agenda item, subject to the reasonable discretion of the Chair.

#### Auxiliary Aid or Accomodation Due to a Disability

If you require an auxiliary aid or accommodation due to a disability, please contact the State Ethics Commission at (808) 587-0460 or email the Commission at <u>ethics@hawaiiethics.org</u> as soon as possible, preferably at least 48 hours prior to the meeting. Requests made as early as possible will allow adequate time to fulfill your request.

Upon request, this notice is available in alternate formats such as large print, Braille, or electronic copy.

#### SUNSHINE LAW MEETING AGENDA ITEM I

#### CONSIDERATION AND APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE MARCH 15, 2023 MEETING

# Attachment 1:Sunshine Law Meeting Minutes of the March 15, 2023<br/>Hawai'i State Ethics Commission Meeting

1 2		SUNSHINE LAW MEETING MINUTES OF THE HAWAI'I STATE ETHICS COMMISSION
3 4 5		STATE OF HAWAI'I
5 6 7	Date:	March 15, 2023
8	Bato.	
9 10	Time:	9:01 a.m.
11 12	Location:	Held via Zoom video and audio conference
13 14		Public Meeting Location
14 15 16		Hawai'i State Ethics Commission Conference Room 1001 Bishop Street
17 18		American Savings Bank Tower, Suite 960 Honolulu, Hawaiʻi 96813
19 20 21	Present:	State Ethics Commission Members
22 23 24 25		Wesley F. Fong, Chair (present in conference room) Reynard D. Graulty, Vice Chair (via video conference) Harry J. McCarthy, Commissioner (via phone call) Robert Hong, Commissioner (via video conference)
26 27 28	Excused:	Beverley Tobias, Commissioner
20 29 30		State Ethics Commission Staff
30 31 32 33 34 35 36 37 38 39		Robert D. Harris, Executive Director (via video conference) Susan D. Yoza, Associate Director (via video conference) Nancy C. Neuffer, Staff Attorney (via video conference) Bonita Y.M. Chang, Staff Attorney (via video conference) Kee M. Campbell, Staff Attorney (via video conference) Jennifer M. Yamanuha, Staff Attorney (via video conference) Patrick W.C. Lui, Computer Specialist (via audio conference)
40	CALL TO O	RDER
41		Four colled the meeting to order at 0.01 and Obain Four Miss Obain
42 43 44	Graulty, Con present. All (	Fong called the meeting to order at 9:01 a.m. Chair Fong, Vice Chair nmissioner McCarthy, Commissioner Hong, and all Commission staff were Commissioners and staff participating via video or audio conference
45 46	contirmed no	o one was in the room with them at their respective remote locations.

Chair Fong noted that no members of the public were present, and the public
 meeting notice included instructions for the public if the Commission's video conference
 connection was lost during the meeting.

5 Executive Director Harris introduced the Commission's new Investigator, Jared 6 Elster. Executive Director Harris noted that Investigator Elster has extensive police 7 experience and came to the Commission most recently from Windward Community 8 College.

9 10 11

# Agenda Item No. I: Consideration and Approval of the Minutes of the February 12 15, 2023 Meeting 13

Commissioner Graulty made and Commissioner Hong seconded a motion to
 approve the minutes of the February 15, 2023, meeting. The motion carried (Fong,
 Graulty, and Hong voting in the affirmative, McCarthy excused).

17 18

### Agenda Item No. II: Executive Director's Report 20

Executive Director Harris reviewed the training statistics for February 2023 and the training schedule for 2023. He noted the Commission held three training sessions in the month of February, including a training with the Governor's office. Executive Director Harris additionally noted that the Department of Human Resources Development had added the self-directed, online ethics training to their learning portal in the beginning of March, and he anticipated a significant increase in the number of participants.

27

28 Executive Director Harris also followed up on the effectiveness of the 29 Commission training sessions, a discussion topic from the last meeting. An attachment 30 was included in this month's agenda showed the results of 1,848 responses received 31 from a total of 2,749 attendees participating in an ethics training session. Sixty-one 32 percent of the responses gave the training session a five out of five in guality, thirty-four 33 percent gave the Commission a four out of five, and five percent gave the Commission 34 a three out of five. Executive Director Harris noted that survey responses were very 35 positive, but questions remain about the long-term effectiveness of the training session. 36 He noted the Commission should continue looking at ways to ensure the training is as 37 effective as possible. Some ideas include short "how to" videos on the website, and 38 follow up emails with training participants to ensure ethics remain top-of-mind with all of 39 the participants.

40

Commissioner McCarthy noted the survey results reflected well on the staff and
 suggested it may be worthwhile to determine if the results change over time. Chair Fong
 concurred. He also asked how many employees have taken the training to date.

45 Executive Director Harris noted that Commissioner Hong had asked a similar 46 question in a past meeting. He added that the plan is to start asking each agency for the 47 total number of employees, with a goal of being able to report a snapshot in time of the percentage of employees completing the ethics training requirement. He hoped results could be shown in three months or so. He additionally noted that 9,000 state employees completed the training last year. As more departments add the ethics training to their existing learning portal, more employees should be undergoing the training this year. Executive Director Harris especially recognized the University of Hawai'i for its excellent efforts to get its employees through the ethics training.

8 Commissioner McCarthy asked if the training has already been provided to the 9 Legislature and, if so, what were the survey results. Executive Director Harris replied 10 that both branches of the Legislature have had a training session, but he was not able 11 to provide specific survey results. 12

13 Chair Fong asked if there is any penalty if a state employee fails to meet the 14 ethics training requirement. Executive Director Harris stated a live database will be 15 publicized at the end of the year, with the training status for each state employee. The 16 expectation is that every employee required to take a live training will meet the 17 requirement so as to avoid negative publicity. Further, if an ethics violation is being 18 addressed, the failure to meet the requirement will likely be tacked on as an additional 19 charge. 20

Executive Director Harris recognized staff for hosting a "spring cleaning" with a focus on disposing of records according to the Commission's document retention policy. Documents were also identified for scanning, with an effort to reduce the number of physical files in the office.

Executive Director Harris noted that the Commission's lease expires in June. Looking at the Commission's physical space needs, two employees now work remotely on a full-time basis. The Commission's fiscal year 2024 budget proposes to bring on one additional employee, for a total of 10 employees in the office. The Commission is in the process of eliminating its physical file server and moving its digital files to the cloud. With a small reduction of people in the office and less physical equipment, the Commission has the capacity to modestly downsize the office space currently leased.

Executive Director Harris asked the State Comptroller if there is an existing state office space available. Assuming no space is available, the current plan is to negotiate a small reduction of office space with the current landlord as well as negotiate another lease proposal with the intent of fairly comparing the two options.

38

25

Executive Director Harris, on a personal note, notified the Commission that he
 was selected Reciprocal Professional Fellow with the U.S. State Department Bureau of
 Education and Cultural Affairs. He will be travelling to Moldova in June and is planning a
 series of lectures and meetings on ethics and government transparency.

- 43
- 44
- 45
- 46 47

1	Agenda Item No. III: 2023 Legislative Session
2 3 4 5	Executive Director Harris updated the Commission about the status of legislation that staff have been tracking. The Commission reviewed each category of bills.
6 7 8	Generally, Executive Director Harris noted that many of the bills in the Ethics Commission's package are largely on track to be approved and signed into law.
9 10 11	<ul> <li>HB 1514, which includes the Ethics Commission's budget, has been transmitted to the Governor.</li> </ul>
12 13 14 15 16	<ul> <li>SB 182, which amends the fines imposed and procedures relating to late financial disclosure statements, was referred to the House judicial committee. Executive Director Harris did not anticipate significant obstacles to its moving forward.</li> </ul>
17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	• HB 136, which requires each chamber of the Legislature to post online a report of the legislative allowance expenditures for each member, was referred to the Senate. Executive Director Harris noted it may not move forward, however both branches of the Legislature have committed to post the reports regardless. Executive Director Harris recognized Susan Yoza for her efforts in drafting this piece of legislation and moving the concept forward.
24 25 26 27	• Executive Director Harris noted that the following bills have all passed out of their respective committees and now require a Senate floor vote:
28 29 30 31 32 33	<ul> <li>HB 141 (requiring each state legislator to disclose any financial relationship they have with lobbyists or lobbying organizations).</li> <li>HB 142 (prohibiting lobbyists from making gifts that are otherwise impermissible under the ethics code).</li> <li>HB 137 (requiring lobbyists to identify the specific bill, resolution, or budget item they lobbied on).</li> </ul>
34 35 36 37	<ul> <li>HB 138 (establishing a mandatory lobbyist training requirement).</li> <li>HB 140 (giving the Commission more discretion with regard to existing document destruction requirements)</li> </ul>
37 38 39 40 41 42	• SB 805, which amends the definition of lobbying to include communication efforts at the executive branch level, was held at the Ethic Commission's request. Staff committed to researching the issue during the interim period and proposing new language at next year's legislative session.
42 43 44 45 46 47	<ul> <li>HB 717, the anti-Nepotism bill, was set for hearing that afternoon. Executive Director Harris acknowledged Staff Attorney Kee Campbell for his advocacy on the bill. Executive Director Harris did not anticipate any significant hurdles with the bill moving forward.</li> </ul>

• SB 1187, which expands the post-employment restriction on lobbying for legislators, has moved to the House Judiciary Committee.

Executive Director Harris concluded by thanking the staff for their efforts in drafting, developing testimony, and helping advocate for these various policy efforts.

#### Agenda Item No. IV: Discussion of Adjudicatory Procedure

Executive Director Harris noted some questions had arisen about the Commission's adjudicatory process. He believed it would be helpful to briefly explain how the Commission investigates complaints. He noted that when a new matter is received by the office, the Commission's staff conducts a preliminary investigation. Staff review is typically limited to public records and discussions with existing state employees.

17 If there is reasonable suspicion or similar standard of belief that a violation of the State Ethics Code occurred, staff then asks the Commission to issue a Resolution to 18 19 Investigate. At this point, the investigation, including the ability to issue subpoenas, 20 broadens. If the investigation demonstrates that there is probable cause that a violation 21 occurred, staff can ask the Commission to issue a Charge. If a Charge is issued, it 22 would be served on the state employee, board or commission member, or elected 23 official. This individual would have an opportunity to respond. If necessary, a further 24 statement of violation could be issued, and a notice of hearing established. At that point, 25 the Commission would hold a contested case to determine findings of fact and 26 conclusions of law.

27

1

2

3 4

5

6 7 8

9

At any point, a complaint could be settled. Any settlement would need to be approved by the Commission, and it has been the policy of the Commission for the settlements to be filed publicly with a few narrow exceptions.

Executive Director Harris noted that much of the investigation process is confidential under existing law. The Commission's administrative rules allow the Executive Director, on a confidential basis, to disclose a matter to law enforcement or an agency administrator for further action as warranted.

Chair Fong observed that department heads should be notified if any of their
employees commit an ethical violation. Commissioner Graulty noted that the
Commission can and will notify a department head if an ethical violation is proven. But
at the Charge stage, the Commission is still investigating. Nothing has been proven yet.
Chair Fong agreed.

42

Chair Fong asked about filing a Charge against someone being prosecuted for a
criminal matter. Executive Director Harris noted the Ethics Commission has concurrent
jurisdiction in such a situation and can pursue a Charge if the appropriate evidentiary
standard has been met. However, the Commission typically avoids proceeding with an
investigation if a criminal proceeding is underway so as to avoid interfering with the

1 2 3	criminal trial. In this situation, the Commission typically stays the Charge until the criminal proceeding is complete.
5 4 5 6 7 8 9	Chair Fong raised the idea of increasing the potential fine for an ethics violation. Executive Director Harris agreed to work on a proposed bill for next year, based on the review of comparable fines in other states. Chair Fong asked for an update at next month's meeting.
10	Agenda Item No. V: Akana v. Hawaii State Ethics Commission and Daniel Gluck,
11	Civil No. 18-1-1019-06 (JHA); Akana v. Hawaii State Ethics Commission, Civil No.
12	19-1-0379-03 (JHA); State of Hawaii, Ethics Commission v. Rowena Akana, Civil
13	No. 20-1-0453 (BIA)
14	
15	There was no update on the Akana case.
16	
17	
18	Agenda Item No. VI: Consideration and Approval of the Minutes of the January 19,
19	2023 Executive Session
20	
21	Commissioner Hong made and Commissioner McCarthy seconded a motion to
22	go into executive session to consider the minutes of the January 19, 2023, executive
23	session meeting. The motion carried unanimously (Fong, Graulty, McCarthy, and Hong
24	voting).
25	voung).
26	Upon returning from the executive session, Chair Fong noted for the record that
27 28	the minutes of the January 19, 2023, executive session meeting were approved unanimously.
29	
30	
31	Agenda Items No. VII: Evaluation of Executive Director Robert Harris
32	
33	Due to the absence of one of the Commissioners, the Commission postponed
34	this agenda item till the next meeting.
35	
36	
37	ADJOURNMENT OF SUNSHINE LAW MEETING
38	
39	At approximately 9:59 a.m., Commissioner McCarthy made and Commissioner
40	Hong seconded a motion to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried unanimously
41	(Fong, Graulty, McCarthy, and Hong voting).
42	
43	The meeting was adjourned at 10:00 a.m.
44	
45	
46	Minutes approved on

#### SUNSHINE MEETING AGENDA ITEM II

#### EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT April 19, 2023

#### 1. Education / Training Report

Attachment 1: 2023 Training Attendance / Schedule

Attachment 2: Online Training Completions by Department

#### 2. Guidance and Assignment Statistics – March 2023

Attachment 3: 2023 Guidance and Assignment Statistics / Website Traffic

#### 3. Miscellaneous Office Projects / Updates

Attachment 4: Q3 Financial Report

#### Attachment 1

#### HAWAII STATE ETHICS COMMISSION

#### **2023 EDUCATION PROGRAM**

#### (Ethics Workshops and Presentations)

	(Lintes Workshops and Presentations)	(Ethics workshops and resentations)							
DATE	PRESENTATIONS	NUMBER OF PARTICIPANTS							
1/4/2023	Lobbyists Law Training, Zoom	50							
1/5/2023	General Ethics Training, DOE, Kawananaoka Middle School	66							
1/10/2023	Lobbyists Law Training, Zoom	19							
1/13/2023	General Ethics Training, Senate, Zoom	80							
1/20/2023	General Ethics Training, House, Capitol, Conference Room 325	47							
1/24/2023	General Ethics Training, Zoom	227							
2/10/2023	General Ethics Training, Zoom	68							
2/21/2023	General Ethics Training, GOV, Capitol, 5th Floor	24							
2/23/2023	General Ethics Training, Zoom	56							
3/10/2023	General Ethics Training, Zoom	20							
3/13/2023	General Ethics Training, UH - Hawai'inuiakea School of Hawaiian Knowledge, Zoom	47							
3/22/2023	Ethics for State Board and Commission members, Zoom	4							
4/5/2023	General Ethics Training, DOE, PBS Hawaii Studio	29							
4/5/2023	General Ethics Training, Zoom	30							
4/20/2023	General Ethics Training, Zoom (CANCELLED)	0							
4/26/2023	General Ethics Training, SPCSC								
5/3/2023	General Ethics Training, Zoom								
5/9/2023	General Ethics Training, DOE, Campbell-Kapolei Complex Area								
5/18/2023	Ethics for State Board and Commission members, Zoom								

#### Sunshine Law Folder - 4/19/2023

#### HAWAII STATE ETHICS COMMISSION

#### **2023 EDUCATION PROGRAM**

#### (Ethics Workshops and Presentations)

	(Ethics workshops and Presentations)	
DATE	PRESENTATIONS	NUMBER OF PARTICIPANTS
6/7/2023	General Ethics Training, Zoom	
6/22/2023	General Ethics Training, Zoom	
7/6/2023	General Ethics Training, Zoom (CANCELLED)	0
7/20/2023	Ethics for State Board and Commission members, Zoom	
8/2/2023	General Ethics Training, Zoom (CANCELLED)	0
8/11/2023	General Ethics Training, Zoom	
8/28/2023	General Ethics Training, DOE, Roosevelt High School	
8/28/2023	General Ethics Training, DOE, Kawananaoka Middle School	
9/7/2023	General Ethics Training, Zoom	
9/21/2023	Ethics for State Board and Commission members, Zoom	
10/13/2023	General Ethics Training, Zoom	
10/25/2023	General Ethics Training, Zoom (CANCELLED)	0
11/16/2023	General Ethics Training, Zoom	
11/29/2023	Ethics for State Board and Commission members, Zoom	
12/7/2023	Ethics for State Government Attorneys, Zoom	
12/8/2023	Ethics for State Government Attorneys, Zoom	
12/21/2023	General Ethics Training, Zoom	
TOTAL	<b>36 Presentations</b>	767 participants

#### Online Training Completions by Department

Department/Agency	2022 Total	2023 Total	<b>Overall Total</b>
Department of Accounting and General Services (DAGS)	55	94	216
Department of Agriculture (DOA)	179	33	266
Department of Budget and Finance (B&F)	102	116	219
Department of Business, Economic Development and Tourism (DBEDT)	47	37	150
Department of Commerce and Consumer Affairs (DCCA)	50	239	336
Department of Corrections and Rehabilitation (DCR)	85	28	113
Department of Defense (DOD)	40	137	250
Department of Education (DOE)	159	34	421
Department of Hawaiian Home Lands (DHHL)	16	65	81
Department of Health (DOH)	314	838	1381
Department of Human Resources Development (DHRD)	7	19	30
Department of Human Services (DHS)	6	822	1032
Department of Labor and Industrial Relations (DLIR)	188	216	445
Department of Land and Natural Resources (DLNR)	59	344	478
Department of Law Enforcement (DLE)	62	28	90
Department of Public Safety (DPS)	523	160	727
Department of Taxation (TAX)	299	105	405
Department of the Attorney General (ATG)	146	302	565
Department of Transportation (DOT)	106	141	528
Hawai'i Health Systems Corporation (HHSC)	8	310	359
Hawai'i State Ethics Commission (HSEC)	4	1	5
Hawai'i State Public Library System (HSPLS)	2	492	495
House of Representatives (REP)	2	30	32
Judiciary (JUD)	84	568	709
Legislative Reference Bureau (LRB)	0	16	16
Office of Hawaiian Affairs (OHA)	45	6	113
Office of the Auditor (AUD)	0	0	3
Office of the Governor (GOV)	10	29	48
Office of the Lieutenant Governor (LTG)	1	0	5
Office of the Ombudsman (OMB)	3	2	7
Other (Please fill-in "Other Department/Agency")	50	8	115
Public Charter School (SPCSC)	25	1	45
Research Corporation of the University of Hawai'i (RCUH)	676	158	843
Senate (SEN)	3	8	15
University of Hawai'i-Community Colleges (UOHC)	552	73	702
University of Hawai'i-Hilo (UOHH)	90	32	125
University of Hawai'i-Manoa (UOHM)	1422	298	1836
University of Hawai'i-System (UOH)	287	65	396
University of Hawai'i-West Oahu (UOHW)	117	49	233
Total Employee Certificates of Completion Issued	5,824	5,904	13,835

Board and Commission	2022 Total	2023 Total	<b>Overall Total</b>
Agribusiness Development Corporation	3	0	3
Board of Acupuncture	1	0	1
Board of Agriculture	0	0	1
Board of Barbering and Cosmetology	2	0	2
Board of Certification of Operating Personnel in Wastewater Treatment Plants	3	0	3
Board of Chiropractic Examiners	1	0	1
Board of Dentistry	9	0	9
Board of Education	2	0	9
Board of Electricians and Plumbers	2	0	3
Board of Land and Natural Resources	2	0	4
Board of Nursing	1	0	1
Board of Pharmacy	1	1	2
Board of Physical Therapy	3	1	4
Board of Professional Engineers, etal	2	0	2
Board of Public Accountancy	1	0	1
Board of Registration	2	0	2
Board of Speech Pathology and Audiology	1	0	1
Board of Taxation Review	1	0	2
Board on Geographic Names	2	0	2
Boxing Commission	0	0	1
Campaign Spending Commission	2	0	2
Civil Rights Commission	1	1	2

#### Sunshine Law Folder - 4/19/2023

#### Online Training Completions by Department

Board and Commission	2022 Total	2023 Total	<b>Overall Total</b>
Commission on Water Resource Management	2	0	3
Contractors License Board	3	0	3
Council on Revenues	0	1	1
Disability and Communication Access Board	1	2	3
Early Learning Board	1	1	2
Elections Commission	2	0	2
Elevator Mechanics Licensing Board	1	0	1
Employees' Retirement System	1	0	1
Enhanced 911 Board	0	1	1
Environmental Advisory Council	2	0	2
Festival of the Pacific Arts & Culture	6	0	6
Hawai'i Board of Optometry	3	1	4
Hawai'i Climate Change Mitigation and Adaptation Commission	1	2	3
Hawai'i Employer-Union Health Benefits Trust Fund	0	1	2
Hawai'i Health Systems Corporation-Corporation	0	0	1
Hawai'i Health Systems Corporation-East Hawai'i	2	2	4
Hawai'i Health Systems Corporation-Oahu	1	0	1
Hawai'i Health Systems Corporation-West Hawai'i	4	0	4
Hawai'i Housing Finance and Development Corporation	0	0	1
Hawai'i Law Enforcement Standards Board	1	0	1
Hawai'i Medical Board	2	0	2
Hawai'i Paroling Authority	3	1	4
Hawai'i Public Housing Authority	6	0	6
Hawai'i State Emergency Response Commission	1	0	1
Hawai'i State Ethics Commission	2	0	4
Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board	7	0	7
Hawai'i Technology Development Corporation	3	0	3
Hawai'i Tourism Authority	1	0	1
Hawaii State Center for Nursing	1	0	1
Hawaiian Homes Commission	2	1	3
Hoisting Machine Operators Advisory Board	1	0	1
Island Burial Council - Kauai/Niihau	0	0	3
Island Burial Council - Molokai	1	0	1
Island Burial Council - Oahu	1	0	2
King Kamehameha Celebration Commission	3	1	4
Land Use Commission	2	0	2
Legacy Land Conservation Commission	0	0	1
Mauna Kea Stewardship and Oversight Authority	0	2	2
Medical Education Council	0	0	1
Motor Vehicle Industry Licensing Board	3	2	5
Motor Vehicle Repair Industry Board	1	1	2
National and Community Service, Hawai'i Commission for	1	0	
Natural Energy Laboratory of Hawai'i	1	0	1
Oahu Metropolitan Planning Organization	3	1	4
Office of Hawaiian Affairs	1	0	1
Other (Please fill-in "Other Board/Commission")	67	10	94
Pest Control Board	3	0	3
RCUH-Board of Directors	1	0	1
Real Estate Commission	3	0	3
Soil and Water Conservation District Boards	9	1	12
Stadium Authority Commission	3	0	3
State Council on Developmental Disabilities	1	0	1
State Foundation on Culture and the Arts	2	0	2
State Public Charter School Commission	2	1	3
Statewide Health Coordinating Council	2	0	2
	2	0	7
University of Hawai'i Board of Regents	-	-	
Total Board and Commission Certificates of Completion Issued	217	35	298

#### **Total Certificates of Completion Issued**

As of April 6, 2023, 12:00 PM

**Attachment 3** 

2023	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	June	July	Aug	Sept	Oct	Nov	Dec	Year to date
Training statistics													
# of In-Person Trainings	2	1	1										4
# of People Trained In Person	113	24	47										184
# of On-Line Trainings (Self-Directed)	1051	522	4042	324									5939
# of Training Webinars	4	2	2										8
# of Participants in Training Webinars	376	124	24										524
Attorney of the Day	125	103	125										353
New assignments													
Advisory Opinion	0	0	0										0
Complaint	18	19	24										61
Gifts/Invitations/Travel	12	25	26										63
Guidance	4	2	1										7
Judicial Selection Comm'n	0	4	2										6
Training Request	0	0	0										0
Record Request	1	1	0										2
Project/Other	6	2	1										9
Total	41	53	54	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	148
Closed Assignments													
Advisory Opinion	0	0	1										1
Complaint	8	4	30										42
Gifts/Invitations/Travel	0	21	34										55
Guidance	0	0	2										2
Judicial Selection Comm'n	0	4	2										6
Training Request	0	0	0										0
Record Request	0	1	0 0										1
Project/Other	1	7	4										12
Total	9	37	73	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	119
Anti-Fraud	3	2	2										7
	5	2	2										1

#### HAWAII STATE ETHICS COMMISSION FINANCIAL REPORT FY 2023 (MONTH ENDING: March 31, 2023) Appropriation Symbol: G-23-393-Y6

	Amount Appropriated FY 2022-2023	Expenditures for Qtr. End 9/30/2022	Expenditures for Qtr. End 12/31/2022	Expenditures for Qtr. End 3/31/2023	•	Year-To-Date Expenditures Totals	% of Budget Expended
A. PERSONNEL SERVICES							
Staff Salaries	\$ 1,061,285.00	\$ 218,466.29 <sup>2</sup>	\$ 245,491.05	\$ 241,966.00	\$ 0.00	705,923.34	66.5%
Total Personnel Services	\$ 1,061,285.00	\$ 218,466.29	\$ 245,491.05		-		
B. OTHER CURRENT EXPENSES							
Office Expenses	14,500.00	2,485.77	3,395.41	3,326.04	0.00	9,207.22	63.5%
Intrastate Transportation and Travel	9,250.00	3.00	125.11	57.50		,	
Out-of-State Travel	12,660.00	1,187.34	0.00	7,600.62			
Equipment Rental and Maintenance	33,700.00	3,207.89	701.70	2,122.32		6,031.91	17.9%
Dues, Subscriptions, Training	16,410.00	801.89	2,561.13	3,755.26		7,118.28	43.4%
Newspaper Advertisements	1,100.00	0.00	35.00	0.00	0.00	35.00	3.2%
Comm'n Mtgs, Investigations, Hrgs	10,500.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.0%
Consulting Services	27,000.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.0%
Office Rent	154,410.00	19,582.24	29,373.36	30,650.49	0.00	79,606.09	51.6%
Total Other Current Expenses	\$ 279,530.00	\$ 27,268.13	\$ 36,191.71	\$ 47,512.23	\$ 0.00	\$ 110,972.07	39.7%
C. CAPITAL OUTLAY							
Office Furniture and Equipment	79,000.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.0%
Total Capital Outlay	\$ 79,000.00	\$ 0.00	\$ 0.00	\$ 0.00	\$0.00	\$ 0.00	0.0%
GRAND TOTAL (A+B+C)	<b>\$ 1,419,815.00</b> <sup>1</sup>	\$ 245,734.42	\$ 281,682.76	\$ 289,478.23	\$ 0.00	\$ 816,895.41	57.5%

<sup>1</sup> \$1,419,815 awarded by Act 1, SLH 2022 - Appropriation 393.

<sup>2</sup> \$26,372.50 additional award from Appropriation 181 for the Cost Adjustments for LEG employees excluded from CBA.

#### HAWAII STATE ETHICS COMMISSION FINANCIAL REPORT FY 2023 (QUARTER ENDING: March 31, 2023) Appropriation Symbol: G-22-396-Y6

	Amount Appropriated FY 2022-2023	•	Expenditures for Qtr. End 12/31/2022	Expenditures for Qtr. End 3/31/2023	Expenditures for Qtr. End 6/30/2023	Year-To-Date Expenditures Totals	% of Budget Expended
A. ACCRUED VACATION/VACATION TRANS	SFERS						
Vacation Payout	\$ 16,553.00 <sup>1</sup>	\$ 0.00	\$ 0.00	\$ 0.00	\$ 0.00	\$ 0.00	0.0%
Total Accrued Vacation/Vacation Transfers	\$ 16,553.00	\$ 0.00	\$ 0.00	\$ 0.00	\$ 0.00	\$ 0.00	0.0%
GRAND TOTAL	\$ 16,553.00	\$ 0.00	\$ 0.00	\$ 0.00	\$ 0.00	\$ 0.00	0.0%
Appropriation for Accrued Vacation/Vacation Total Expenditures as of March 31, 2023						\$ 0.00	
Balance as of March 31, 2023						\$ 16,553.00	

<sup>1</sup> Funds for accrued vacation and vacation transfer payments appropriated by Act 2, SLH 2022, for \$16,553.00.

G:Share/Budget/Reports/2022-23/FY23 Q3

#### SUNSHINE LAW MEETING AGENDA ITEM III

#### 2023 LEGISLATIVE SESSION

#### SUNSHINE LAW MEETING AGENDA ITEM IV

#### PROPOSED MEDIA POLICY

The Hawai'i State Ethics Commission welcomes transparency, recognizing its responsibility to improve and maintain public confidence in government officials and employees. It shall be the policy of the Commission to issue a media alert with respect to any ethics opinions or decisions, such as an issuance of a settlement agreement or an advisory opinion, with a brief, objective description of the action taken.

#### SUNSHINE LAW MEETING AGENDA ITEM V

#### PROPOSED INCREASE TO THE COMMISSION'S ADMINISTRATIVE FINE AUTHORITY (HAW. REV. STAT. § 84-39 AND HAW. REV. STAT. § 97-7)

No update on research looking into comparable fine structures in other states.

#### SUNSHINE LAW MEETING AGENDA ITEM VI

# DISCUSSION OF AN INFORMATIONAL MEETING WITH THE STATE AND COUNTY ETHICS COMMISSIONS OR BOARDS.

#### SUNSHINE LAW MEETING AGENDA ITEM VII

#### AKANA v. HAWAII STATE ETHICS COMMISSION AND DANIEL GLUCK, CIVIL NO. 18-1-1019-06 (JHA); AKANA v. HAWAII STATE ETHICS COMMISSION, CIVIL NO. 19-1-0379-03 (JHA); STATE OF HAWAII, ETHICS COMMISSION v. ROWENA AKANA, CIVIL NO. 20-1-0453 (BIA)

Discussion of case status.

The Hawai'i State Ethics Commission may convene an executive session pursuant to Hawai'i Revised Statutes section 92-5(a)(4) to consult with the Commission's attorneys on questions and issues pertaining to the Commission's powers, duties, privileges, immunities, and liabilities.

#### SUNSHINE LAW MEETING AGENDA ITEM VIII

#### EVALUATION OF EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR ROBERT HARRIS

The Hawai'i State Ethics Commission may convene an executive session pursuant to Hawai'i Revised Statutes section 92-5(a)(2) to discuss matters relating to the evaluation of an employee, and/or pursuant to section 92-5(a)(4), to consult with the Commission's attorneys on questions and issues pertaining to the Commission's powers, duties, privileges, immunities, and liabilities.

(Attachments for Commissioners Only)

#### SUNSHINE LAW MEETING AGENDA ITEM IX

#### RECOGNITION OF AN OUTSTANDING COMMISSION EMPLOYEE